

**CHARTER TOWNSHIP OF VAN BUREN
PLANNING COMMISSION
December 9, 2015
MINUTES**

Chairperson Thompson called the meeting to order at 7:31 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Present: McKenna, Budd, Kelley, Boynton, Jackson, Franzoi and Thompson.

Excused: None.

Staff: Director Akers, Deputy Director Best and Secretary Harman.

Planning Representatives: McKenna Associate, Sally Hodges.

Audience: Six (6).

APPROVAL OF AGENDA:

Motion McKenna, Franzoi second to approve the agenda of December 9, 2015 as presented.

Motion Carried.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Motion Boynton, Kelley second to approve the minutes from October 28, 2015 as presented.

Motion Carried.

CORRESPONDENCE:

Planning Commission By-Law Revisions.

NEW BUSINESS:

ITEM # 1

CASE# SPR 13-009

TITLE:

THE APPLICANT, BETHANY BIBLE CHURCH, IS REQUESTING AN AMENDMENT TO THEIR SITE PLAN APPROVAL TO PERFORM SITE IMPROVEMENTS AS REQUIRED IN SECTION 12.02 OF THE ZONING ORDINANCE 06-02-92, AS AMENDED.

LOCATION:

THE SUBJECT SITE IS LOCATED ON PARCEL TAX ID NUMBER V125-83-088-99-0013-704, ALSO KNOWN AS 810 HURON RIVER DRIVE. THE SITE IS LOCATED ON THE SOUTH SIDE OF HURON RIVER DRIVE, BETWEEN HURON RIVER DRIVE AND SAVAGE. THE SITE IS IN THE R1-B, RESIDENTIAL ZONING DISTRICT.

Director Akers presented his review letter dated 12-9-15 recommending approval subject to the conditions referenced in the letter. The applicant, Bethany Bible Church amended the landscaping plan in order to be compliant with Wayne County storm water management.

Wade Hoppe gave the presentation for the applicant. Mr. Hoppe discussed the proposed thirty-five (35) arborvitae and their placement, the type of arborvitae "eastern white cedar", screening for the neighboring homes, the location of the bio swale on the site plan, removal of two (2) hydrants on the site plan and the age and size of shade trees for placement on the site.

Commissioners discussed screening for neighboring homeowners, the previously approved number of shade trees and arborvitae, different types of arborvitaes, zoning ordinance requirements, planting more shade trees (honeysuckle and sumac) and reducing the number of arborvitae and adding trees to the parking lot area and a portion of neighbor #3's property that Bethany Bible Church owns.

No comments from the audience.

Motion Boynton, Budd second to grant an amendment to site plan approval for Bethany Bible Church to perform site improvements as required in section 12.02 of the zoning ordinance 06-02-92, as amended, for 810 Huron River Drive, site located on the south side of Huron River Drive, between Huron River Drive and Savage Road zoned R1-B residential, subject to recommendations in Director Akers review letter dated 12-9-15, recommendation #1 to reduce the total number to twenty-five (25) arborvitae for screening and six (6) 1 ½ " caliber shade trees, with two (2) shade trees in parking area next to neighbor #6 and the remaining trees in the portion of neighbor #3's property that the church owns. Motion Carried. (Letter attached)

ITEM # 2 ELECTION OF OFFICERS

Motion Franzoi, Kelley second to open nominations. Carried.

Motion Budd, Franzoi second to nominate Carol Thompson as Chairperson, Donald Boynton as Vice-Chairperson and Bryon Kelley as Secretary. Motion Carried.

Motion McKenna, Franzoi second to close the nominations and elect. Carried.

ITEM # 3 PLANNING COMMISSION BY-LAW REVISIONS

Motion Boynton, Kelley second to record the Commission Rules and Procedures. Motion Carried.

GENERAL DISCUSSION:

ITEM #1 LAKESHORE ORDINANCE

Sally Hodges of McKenna Associates presented definitions of major and minor watercraft repairs. The Environmental Commission reviewed the Draft Lakeshore Ordinance and asked for clarification from the Planning Commission on their intent of removing watercraft repair language.

Commissioners discussed the definitions provided of major and minor watercraft repairs and agreed to remove item 6-p regarding such repairs from the Lakeshore Ordinance. Staff will meet with the public prior to the Public Hearing and will coordinate meeting dates with the Planning Commission.

Motion Budd, McKenna second to adjourn at 9:01 p.m. Motion Carried.

Respectfully submitted,

Christina Harman
Recording Secretary



Charter Township of Van Buren

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

SUPERVISOR
Linda H. Combs

CLERK
Leon Wright

TREASURER
Sharry A. Budd

TRUSTEE
Phillip C. Hart

TRUSTEE
Jeffrey L. Jahr

TRUSTEE
Brenda J. McClanahan

TRUSTEE
Reggie Miller

December 9, 2015

Planning Commission
Charter Township of Van Buren
46425 Tyler Road
Belleville, MI 48111

Subject: SPR 13-009, Bethany Bible Church, Site Plan Amendment

Dear Commissioners:

On January 22, 2014, Bethany Bible obtained final site plan approval from the Planning Commission in order to renovate and expand its building and parking lot at 810 E. Huron River Drive. After applying for a permit to work in the Wayne County road right-of-way, the County indicated that the site would need to be brought into compliance with the Wayne County Storm Water Ordinance standards which are more extensive than the Township requirements in our Engineering Standards Manual. It is my understanding that after discussion between the Township, our consultants, and the applicant, it was ultimately decided that the standards of the Wayne County Storm Water Ordinance which include vegetation mix standards, were applicable. On August 13, 2015 a site inspection was performed by our Planning Consultant which demonstrated that several of the trees proposed as part of the original site plan approval had not been planted. Additionally after meeting with the applicant, we have learned that due to Wayne County's storm water requirements, the applicant was unable to comply with the landscape plan that was originally proposed and approved. Based on this the applicant has submitted an amended landscape plan to the Planning Commission for their approval. Based on my review of that landscape plan I offer the following:

Landscaping and Screening:

1. General Site Landscaping – The Zoning Ordinance requires one tree per 3,000 SF of landscaped area less berms and ponds. According to the revised site plan, the applicant added storm water detention in certain areas adjacent to the parking lot. Due to this the total landscaped area was reduced in size from 12,172 sf to 10,037 sf. Based on this, 10,037 sf of landscaped area would require four (4) trees to be planted. According to my review of the site plan 81 trees have been provided. This section has been met.

2. Vehicular Surface Area Landscaping:

A. Percent of Landscaping - The applicant has complied with the requirement that internal landscaping be provided at 5% percent of all paved areas (105,791 sf of paved area, 5% = 5,289 sf required, 8,678 provided.

B. Square Footage/Trees – The Zoning Ordinance requires that each separate landscaped area shall be a minimum of 360 square feet and it requires that one tree be planted for each 100 square feet of interior landscaping. The applicant has indicated in the summary that each internal landscape area meets this requirement. Based on the tree requirement calculation, at 1 tree per 100 square feet for 8,678 square feet of internal landscaping area, a minimum of 87 trees are required by the Zoning Ordinance and only 81 have been provided. **Due to this an**

additional 6 trees will be required to be planted to be compliant with the minimum standard of the Zoning Ordinance.

3. Arborvitae – The calculation on the site plan and cover letter includes proposed arborvitae in the calculation of number of trees. This is not consistent with the Township Zoning Ordinance nor any past practice of the Planning Commission that I am aware of and this will need to be revised.

4. Irrigation – The applicant has proposed to eliminate two (2) yard hydrants which are located on the northern end of the parking lot adjacent to neighbor 3 and at the northern end of the parking lot adjacent to the playground. The Zoning Ordinance requires that the applicant provide an acceptable system of irrigation and the applicant has indicated that they plan to irrigate with two (2) hose bibs attached to the east and west side of the building. **If the Planning Commission finds this acceptable then they should specifically indicated that in their decision.**

4. Screening – The Zoning Ordinance allows the Planning Commission flexibility in determining what screening standards are appropriate to the situation. This is in section 4.40.3(a)(4), where it indicates that, “in consideration of the overall design and impact of the landscape plan, the Planning Commission may modify and adjust the requirements herein for ... or as part of a screen, provided that such adjustment is keeping with the intent of the Ordinance...” Looking at the previously approved site plan, the Planning Commission reviewed this standard based on the preferences of the adjacent neighbors. Based on this concept the applicant has proposed changes to their screening of the adjacent residential property. The screening methods used for the adjacent properties are as follows:

- A. Neighbor 1 (856 E. Huron River Dr.) - It was indicated on the previous site plan that neighbor one (856 E. Huron River Drive) wanted no changes to the existing site. This has stayed consistent between the two plans.
- B. Neighbor 2 (864 E. Huron River Dr.) – On the original site plan a vinyl fence was intended to be placed between the Church property and this property. The amended plan removes this fence. The applicant has provided us with a letter, signed by the owner of the property who requests that the church be released from the obligation to install the fence. The owner has indicated that their preference is to keep the area open.
- C. Neighbor 3 (824 E. Huron River Dr.) – This property is now owned by Bethany Bible Church and they have indicated they want no additional screening between the properties.
- D. Neighbor 4 (794 E. Huron River Dr.) – The approved landscape plan depicted a small berm and bushes adjacent to this property. The applicant has submitted a letter indicating that their preference is to keep the area open and free of any trees and bushes. Based on this and the fact that there is now a bio-swale in this location, the applicant has removed the previously proposed screening. Additionally on the site plan the bio-swale is depicted over the adjacent parking spaces, I believe this is an error, **but the bio-swale needs to be placed in the correct location on the plan.**
- E. Neighbor 5 (Adjacent Church) – There are no changes between the approved site plan and previous site plan.
- F. Neighbor 6 (763 Greylock St.) – It was brought to the Township’s attention that there was a concern that the 25’ buffer was still allowing headlight glare onto this property. In our discussion the applicant proposed supplementing the 25’ buffer with an additional 28 arborvitae (along Neighbor 6 & 7’s frontage) in order to mitigate this issue.
- G. Neighbor 7 (791 Greylock St.) – The applicant has proposed adding additional arborvitae along the 25’ buffer to mitigate the impact of headlight glare.

5. General Landscape Plan Comments – In general the strike through text and crossed out items on the proposed has been helpful for review purposes, but the final landscape plan needs to be updated to eliminate these. **To address this the applicant will need to provide a clean, updated version of the site plan which depicts the accurate conditions proposed and eliminates the strikethrough text and removed items.**

RECOMMENDATION

We recommend that the Planning Commission approve the site plan amendment to SPR 13-009 to amend the landscape plan subject to the following conditions:

1. That an additional six (6) trees will be added to the interior landscaping area of the site plan to meet the minimum standards in the Zoning Ordinance.
2. The Bio-swale adjacent to Neighbor Four (794 E. Huron River Dr.) shall be relocated in the correct position on the site plan.
3. Planning Commission approval regarding the use of Hose Bibs attached to the building as an acceptable means of irrigation.
4. The applicant shall provide a clean, updated version of the landscape plan which depicts the accurate conditions proposed and eliminates the strikethrough text and removed items.

Respectfully submitted,

Ron Akers, AICP
Director of Planning & Economic Development
Charter Township of Van Buren